From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are the timekeeper
The discussion process depends on you!

Your role
→ To ensure that each stage is completed **within the time allowed.** (stage 1: 45 mins; stage 2: 20 mins)
→ To ensure that **every person can speak** and be clearly heard.

Your powers
→ You start and end each stage of the game.
→ You grant and withhold speaking rights during the game.

Your constraints
→ You may not give your personal opinion during the discussion.
→ You may not prevent the guide from speaking.

Your qualities
You are **precise**, **rigorous**, aware of time passing and the need to **keep to the time allowed**. You want all the players to **speak freely** during the game. You **watch the suppliers of ideas carefully** to identify those who would like to speak. You grant the right to speak **fairly** and **kindly**, treating all participants with equal respect. You make sure that no one **monopolises the discussion**.

Your actions
→ Looking at your watch.
→ Announcing the start and finish of each stage.
→ Identifying who may speak.
→ Tactfully interrupting anyone who talks too much.

Your equipment
A watch; rules for selecting speakers (see below).

Rules for selecting speakers:
Stage 1 (group thinking - 45 mins):
Participants must ask for the right to speak. Priority goes to those who haven’t spoken before; to short clarificatory questions (raising a finger) over statement interventions (raising a hand).

Stage 2 (report on thinking - 20 mins), speakers in order of priority:
1. The **secretary** for a summary of the discussion on the blackboard
2. The **guide’s observer** (if present), followed by the **guide** for thoughts on his/her role
3. The **timekeeper’s observer** (if present), followed by the **timekeeper** for thoughts on his/her role
You are the guide
The progress and coherence of the discussion depend on you!

Your role (stage 1)
You ensure that the suppliers of ideas don’t lose their way in the discussion but seek to answer the question posed.

Your powers
→ You may interrupt the discussion whenever you think it appropriate.
→ You may question someone who has just spoken.

Your constraints
→ You may not give your personal opinion on what is said or join in the discussion with the other players.
→ You may not question the same person twice in a row.

Your qualities
You’re able to listen to people carefully and to remain focused and silent for a long time. You are demanding with those who are speaking and you don’t like unfocused discussions that go round in circles or spin off in all directions. You are rigorous and methodical. You believe that a question must be carefully formulated, analysed and understood before any attempt to solve it can be made.

You don’t say much, you’re not pushy and don’t try to dominate. You are able to steer a discussion in a flexible, unobtrusive way by putting the right questions to the right person at the right moment. You gently encourage the players to think more deeply.

Your actions
Questioning a player who has just spoken.

Example questions to steer the discussion:
1. Ask players to clearly define the most important words in the question.
2. Ask players to define the link between what they have said and the question under discussion (Is it an answer to the question? To a different question?)
3. Ask players to define the link between what they have just said and what the previous player said (Is it an objection, confirmation, illustration? etc.).
4. Ask players to use their talents.
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are the secretary
The existence of a record of the discussion depends on you!

Your role
→ Make a record of the main ideas discussed. (stage 1)
→ Give the group a summary of the main ideas discussed. (stage 2)

Your powers
→ You take notes. (stage 1)
→ You give a summary of your notes out loud. (stage 2)

Your constraints
→ You may not speak during the discussion. (stage 1)
→ You may not speak unless invited to do so by the timekeeper. (stage 2)

Your qualities
You listen carefully to people and can remain focused and silent for a long time. You can identify what’s important and what isn’t. You are rigorous and methodical. You systematically note every attempt at an answer suggested by players to both the question posed and the interim questions that the group tries to answer.

Your actions
→ Listening
→ Note-taking
→ Speaking
→ Summarising your notes on the blackboard (using numbers, arrows, keywords, mindmaps, etc.)

Your equipment
Note-taking materials (paper, flipchart, computer, etc.).
You might like to draw (two-way) tables.
Blackboard.

Model for note-taking:
Main question discussed:
....................................................................................................................?
Players’ answers:........................................................................
Dissenting opinion: .................................................................

Interim questions:
1. ..............................................................................................?
Players’ answers:.................................................................
Dissenting opinion: .................................................................
2. ..............................................................................................?
Players’ answers:.................................................................
Dissenting opinion: .................................................................
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: comparisons
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.
You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent
Comparisons. You think that images and comparisons often make it easier to understand things that might otherwise seem very complicated.

Your favourite phrases:
“We could use an image to understand this better...”; “…that’s like...”; “What can we compare that to?”; “That reminds me of...”; “Can we compare those things?”; “We could draw an analogy with the link between ... and ...”; “The metaphor of the .... might be useful for understanding...”; etc.
objections

From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
definitions

From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: objections
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be. You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent
Objections. You can’t help it, whenever anyone says anything you immediately start trying to see why it’s wrong or incomplete. Your critical powers are highly developed.

Your favourite phrases:
“I don’t agree!”; “Yes, but...”; “You could look at that in a different way...”; “How can you say that when...”; “Isn’t this a contradiction in terms?”; “Isn’t this just a Straw Man?”; “Does B really follow from A?”; “What’s the point of this if you know it can’t be put into practice?”; etc.
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: definitions
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.

You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent: Definitions. You believe it is crucial to clarify the meanings of words in a group discussion in order to prevent potential misunderstandings. You believe that labelling an argument or statement can help people understand its core principle.

Your favourite phrases:

“Could you clarify what you mean by ...?”; “What’s your understanding of that term?”; “Can we agree on a definition of the word ‘...’?”; “It seems that we don’t all understand the word ‘...’ in the same way”; “This term can be understood in two ways, x or y. Which are you referring to here?”; “Would you agree that we can label this argument as...?”; etc.
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: reconciliation

The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)

To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers

→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints

→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities

You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.

You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions

→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent

Reconciliation. You hate conflict and always try to get everyone to agree. You manage to see elements in common that are invisible to everyone else.

Your favourite phrases:

“What do these things have in common?”; “There are points of agreement here”; “We could draw a parallel between this idea and that one...”; “There are many connections/similarities between...”; “Can we balance/ find a compromise between your positions?”; “Do we have a consensus?”; etc.
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: synthesis

The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)

To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers

→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints

→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities

You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.

You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions

→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent

Synthesis. You believe that it’s necessary to take a moment every now and then to recap the progress made in the discussion so far, what has been said and what still needs to be done.

Your favourite phrases:

“To sum up... “; “Can we have a recap?”; “As a rapid overview of where we’ve got to so far...”; “If we reconstruct the argument we’ve used up till now...”; “How far have we got with this discussion?”; etc.
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: consequences
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.
You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent
Consequences. You are logical and you like to take arguments and ideas to extremes to see where they end up.

Your favourite phrases:
“Have you thought about the consequences of that?”; “If you take that argument to the extreme you end up with the idea...”; “Saying that implies that...”; “We need to think about the consequences of that...”; etc.
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: presuppositions
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.

You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent
Presuppositions. When we speak we often presuppose many things that we regard as obvious and don’t bother to define. You believe that these presuppositions must all be revealed and verified to enable people to think properly.

Your favourite phrases:
“In saying that we’re implying...”; “When you say ... you’re assuming...”; “You can’t say that unless you also agree that ...”; “Your question/ statement is based on the idea that... “; “What do we have to believe in order to say this?”; etc.
key concepts

From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: key concepts
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.
You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Key concepts. Some are more complicated than others, but you still like to suggest them now and then to try to move the thinking on. You know these concepts can offer a useful toolkit for clarifying difficult problems.

Your favourite key concepts:

factual/normative; cause/effect; instrumental (means)/intrinsic (end); in theory/in practice; hypothetical/real; believed to be real/proven; essential/accidental; necessary/contingent; qualitative/quantitative; objective/subjective; absolute/relative; procedural/substantive; kinds of opposites (Aristotle) (e.g. tasty, tasteless, disgusting); veil of ignorance (Rawls); etc.
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: examples

The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)

To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers

➔ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints

➔ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities

You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.

You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions

➔ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
➔ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
➔ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent

Examples. You believe it’s impossible to think properly if we are too abstract or get stuck on generalisations. You like to base your thinking on concrete examples taken from real life.

Your favourite phrases:

“Could we find an example?”; “Could you give us an illustration of that?”; “What real situations would that correspond to?”; “Have you ever been able to check that? When?”; “For example...”; “In a concrete situation where ...”; etc.
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are a supplier of ideas

Your talent: reformulation
The quality of thinking depends on you!

Your role (stage 1: group thinking)
To enhance group thinking by supplying ideas, comments and criticisms.

Your powers
→ You can give your opinion on the question posed.

Your constraints
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper has given you permission.

Your qualities
You’re spontaneous and relaxed and you aren’t afraid to tell the group what you think. You enjoy discussions and swapping ideas with others. You’re curious and inventive. You like to suggest hypotheses and discover new ideas, however surprising they may be.
You think mistakes are useful and help move things forward. You are modest. In discussions you’re always willing to admit you were wrong and to acknowledge your own ignorance.

You’re interested in other people’s ideas and listen carefully to what they have to say. Before speaking you check that what you’re going to say is pertinent at that point in the discussion. If it isn’t, you wait for a better moment, to ensure that the discussion stays on track.

Your actions
→ Raising a finger (to request a brief clarification).
→ Raising your hand (to contribute an idea).
→ Giving your opinion; using your talent.

Your talent
Reformulation. You believe that it’s very useful to repeat things in many different ways to ensure that everyone understands each other well and is talking about the same thing.

Your favourite phrases:
“So, if I understand you right, you mean that .... – is that right?”; “Would we understand it better if we put it another way?”; “I don’t quite understand, could you use a different phrase/word?”; “So, for you, ... is the same as ...? “; etc.
You are the timekeeper’s observer

The group’s awareness of the timekeeper’s importance depends on you!

**Your role**

You help the group understand the timekeeper’s role.

**Your powers**

→ You observe and evaluate the way that the timekeeper carries out his/her role. (stage 1)
→ You communicate your observations and evaluations and suggest improvements. (stage 2)

**Your constraints**

→ You may not speak during the discussion. (stage 1)
→ You may not speak unless invited to do so by the timekeeper. (stage 2)

**Your qualities**

You listen carefully to people and remain focused and silent for a long time. You’re observant. You often notice details that no one else sees, and know how to get into the best place from which to observe (swapping places with others whenever necessary).

**Your actions**

Observing – Taking notes - Speaking

**Your equipment**

Note-taking materials (paper, flipchart, computer, etc.). You might like to draw (two-way) tables.

**Advice to observers:**

Whenever someone starts to speak you must check that the timekeeper is meeting the requirements of her/his role (R) power (P1) and constraints (C1 and C2):

- R: Ensures that every group member can speak and be heard clearly Yes/No
- P1: Grants and withholds speaking rights Yes/No
- C1: May not give an opinion on what is said or join in the discussion with the other players Yes/No
- C2: May not control the “guide”’s right to speak Yes/No
From an original idea by C.deC. for la Saline royale. Translated and modified by T.S. and A.G. for the Bernheim Project (Université catholique de Louvain, Chaire Hoover).

www.philoteam.org
You are the guide’s observer

The group’s awareness of the guide’s importance depends on you!

Your role

You help the group understand the guide’s role.

Your powers

→ You observe and evaluate the way that the guide fulfils his/her role (stage 1)
→ You communicate your observations and evaluations and suggest improvements (stage 2)

Your constraints

→ You may not speak during the discussion (stage 1)
→ You may not speak unless the timekeeper invites you to do so (stage 2)

Your qualities

You listen carefully to people and remain focused and silent for a long time. You’re observant. You often notice details that no one else sees, and know how to get into the best place from which to observe (swapping places with others whenever necessary).

Advice to observers:

Whenever the guide speaks you must observe that he/she properly meets the requirements of his/her role (R), powers (P1 and P2) and constraints (C1 and C2):

- R: Enables thinking to move forward Yes/No
- P1: Freely interrupts discussion Yes/No
- P2: Questions someone who has just spoken Yes/No
- C1: May not join the discussion with the other players Yes/No
- C2: May not question the same person twice in a row Yes/No

Your actions

Observing – Note-taking - Speaking

Your equipment

Note-taking materials (paper, flipchart, computer, etc.).
You might like to draw (two-way) tables.